

Elegant memoization

Conal Elliott

Tabula

April 3, 2014

Laziness

- Value computed only when inspected.
- Saved for reuse.
- Every part of a data structure.
- Insulate definition from use: *modularity*.
- Routinely program with infinite structures.

What about functions?

- Functions as indexed collections.
- Are “accesses” cached?

What about functions?

- Functions as indexed collections.
- Are “accesses” cached?
- Why not?

What is memoization?

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.
- Ironic flaw: only correct for pure functions.

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.
- Ironic flaw: only correct for pure functions.
- My definition: *conversion of functions into data structures*

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.
- Ironic flaw: only correct for pure functions.
- My definition: *conversion of functions into data structures*
- ... without loss of information.

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.
- Ironic flaw: only correct for pure functions.
- My definition: *conversion of functions into data structures*
- ... without loss of information.
- Preferably incremental.

What is memoization?

- Conventional story: mutable hash tables.
- Ironic flaw: only correct for pure functions.
- My definition: *conversion of functions into data structures*
- ... without loss of information.
- Preferably incremental.
- How?

Convenient notation

I'll use some non-standard (for Haskell) type notation:

type 1 = ()

data 0 -- no values

type (\times) = (,)

type (+) = *Either*

infixl 7 \times

infixl 6 +

Examples

$f :: Bool \rightarrow Int$

$f\ x = \text{if } x \text{ then } 3 \text{ else } 5$

Examples

$f :: \text{Bool} \rightarrow \text{Int}$

$f\ x = \text{if } x \text{ then } 3 \text{ else } 5$

$g :: \text{Int} \rightarrow \text{String}$

$g\ () = \text{map toUpper "memoize!"}$

Examples

$f :: \text{Bool} \rightarrow \text{Int}$

$f\ x = \text{if } x \text{ then } 3 \text{ else } 5$

$g :: \mathbf{1} \rightarrow \text{String}$

$g\ () = \text{map toUpper "memoize!"}$

$h :: \text{Bool} \times \text{Bool} \rightarrow \text{Int}$

$h\ (x, y) = f\ (x \wedge y) + f\ (x \vee y)$

Examples

$f :: Bool \rightarrow Int$

$f\ x = \text{if } x \text{ then } 3 \text{ else } 5$

$g :: \mathbf{1} \rightarrow String$

$g\ () = map\ toUpper\ "memoize!"$

$h :: Bool \times Bool \rightarrow Int$

$h\ (x, y) = f\ (x \wedge y) + f\ (x \vee y)$

$k :: Bool + Bool \rightarrow Int$

$k\ (\text{Left } x) = \text{if } x \text{ then } 3 \text{ else } 5$

$k\ (\text{Right } y) = \text{if } y \text{ then } 4 \text{ else } 6$

More examples

- $\text{Bool} + \text{Bool} \times \text{Bool} \rightarrow \dots$
- $\text{Nat} \rightarrow \dots$
- $[a] \rightarrow \dots$

What's really going on here?

- Remember: conversion of functions into data structures.
- Different shape for each domain type.
- Consider domain types systematically

What's really going on here?

- Remember: conversion of functions into data structures.
- Different shape for each domain type.
- Consider domain types systematically:
0, 1, $a + b$, $a \times b$, $a \rightarrow b$, data.

What's really going on here?

- Goal: capture all of a function's information.
- Make precise:

What's really going on here?

- Goal: capture all of a function's information.
- Make precise: ability to convert back. *Isomorphism*.

What's really going on here?

- Goal: capture all of a function's information.
- Make precise: ability to convert back. *Isomorphism*.
- Domain type drives the memo structure.

Type isomorphisms

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \quad \cong$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\begin{array}{rcl} \mathbf{0} \rightarrow a & \cong & \mathbf{1} \\ \mathbf{1} \rightarrow a & \cong & \end{array}$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\begin{array}{rcl} \mathbf{0} \rightarrow a & \cong & \mathbf{1} \\ \mathbf{1} \rightarrow a & \cong & a \end{array}$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \quad \cong \quad \mathbf{1}$$

$$\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \quad \cong \quad a$$

$$(b + c) \rightarrow a \quad \cong$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$$

$$\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \cong a$$

$$(b + c) \rightarrow a \cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a)$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$$

$$\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \cong a$$

$$(b + c) \rightarrow a \cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a)$$

$$(b \times c) \rightarrow a \cong$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$$

$$\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \cong a$$

$$(b + c) \rightarrow a \cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a)$$

$$(b \times c) \rightarrow a \cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a &\cong \mathbf{1} \\ \mathbf{1} \rightarrow a &\cong a \\ (b + c) \rightarrow a &\cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a) \\ (b \times c) \rightarrow a &\cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)\end{aligned}$$

Compare with laws of exponents:

$$\begin{aligned}a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b\end{aligned}$$

Type isomorphisms

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a &\cong \mathbf{1} \\ \mathbf{1} \rightarrow a &\cong a \\ (b + c) \rightarrow a &\cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a) \\ (b \times c) \rightarrow a &\cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)\end{aligned}$$

Compare with laws of exponents:

$$\begin{aligned}a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b\end{aligned}$$

These rules form a memoization algorithm.

Type isomorphisms

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a &\cong \mathbf{1} \\ \mathbf{1} \rightarrow a &\cong a \\ (b + c) \rightarrow a &\cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a) \\ (b \times c) \rightarrow a &\cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)\end{aligned}$$

Compare with laws of exponents:

$$\begin{aligned}a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b\end{aligned}$$

These rules form a memoization algorithm.

Catch: \perp .

An implementation of memoization

From *MemoTrie*:

```
class HasTrie t where
  type t ↪ a
  trie    :: (t → a) → (t ↪ a)
  untrie :: (t ↪ a) → (t → a)
```

Law: *trie* and *untrie* are inverses, so $(t \rightarrow a) \cong (t \mapsto a)$ (modulo \perp).

Memoization:

An implementation of memoization

From *MemoTrie*:

```
class HasTrie t where
  type t ↪ a
  trie    :: (t → a) → (t ↪ a)
  untrie :: (t ↪ a) → (t → a)
```

Law: *trie* and *untrie* are inverses, so $(t \rightarrow a) \cong (t \mapsto a)$ (modulo \perp).

Memoization:

```
memo :: HasTrie t ⇒ (t → a) → (t ↪ a)
memo = untrie ∘ trie
```

Void

Isomorphism: $\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$.

Void

Isomorphism: $\mathbf{0} \rightarrow a \cong \mathbf{1}$.

Instance:

```
instance HasTrie 0 where
    type 0 ↪ a = 1
    trie void = ()
    untrie () = void
```

where

```
void :: 0 → z
-- empty definition
```

Unit

Isomorphism: $\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \cong a$.

Unit

Isomorphism: $\mathbf{1} \rightarrow a \cong a$.

Instance:

```
instance HasTrie 1 where
```

```
  type 1 ↪ a = a
```

```
  trie f = f ()
```

```
  untrie a = λ() → a
```

Boolean

Isomorphism: $\text{Bool} \rightarrow a \cong a \times a.$

Boolean

Isomorphism: $\text{Bool} \rightarrow a \cong a \times a$.

Instance:

```
instance HasTrie Bool where
  type Bool ↪ a = a × a
  trie f = (f False, f True)
  untrie (x, y) = λc → if c then y else x
```

Sums

Isomorphism: $(b + c) \rightarrow a \cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a)$.

Sums

Isomorphism: $(b + c) \rightarrow a \cong (b \rightarrow a) \times (c \rightarrow a)$.

Instance:

```
instance (HasTrie b, HasTrie c) ⇒ HasTrie (b + c) where
  type (b + c) ↪ a = (b ↪ a) × (c ↪ a)
  trie f = (trie (f ∘ Left), trie (f ∘ Right))
  untrie (s, t) = untrie s ||| untrie t
```

where

$$\begin{aligned}(g ||| h)(Left\ b) &= g\ b \\ (g ||| h)(Right\ c) &= h\ c\end{aligned}$$

Products

Isomorphism: $(b \times c) \rightarrow a \cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)$.

Products

Isomorphism: $(b \times c) \rightarrow a \cong b \rightarrow (c \rightarrow a)$.

Instance:

```
instance (HasTrie b, HasTrie c) ⇒ HasTrie (b × c) where
  type (b × c) ↪ a = b ↪ (c ↪ a)
  trie f = trie (trie ∘ curry f)
  untrie t = uncurry (untrie ∘ untrie t)
```

where

$$\begin{aligned} \text{curry } g\ b\ c &= g\ (b, c) \\ \text{uncurry } h\ (b, c) &= h\ b\ c \end{aligned}$$

Data types

Handle other types via isomorphism:

$$(u, v, w) \cong (u \times v) \times w$$

$$[u] \cong \mathbf{1} + u \times [u]$$

$$T\ u \cong u + T\ u \times T\ u$$

$$Bool \cong \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}$$

Turn it around

Exponentials:

$$\begin{aligned} a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b \end{aligned}$$

Turn it around

Exponentials:

$$\begin{aligned} a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b \end{aligned}$$

Take logarithms, and flip equations:

$$\begin{aligned} \log_a 1 &= 0 \\ \log_a a &= 1 \\ \log_a(a^b \times a^c) &= b + c \\ \log_a(a^c)^b &= b \times c \end{aligned}$$

Turn it around

Exponentials:

$$\begin{aligned} a^0 &= 1 \\ a^1 &= a \\ a^{b+c} &= a^b \times a^c \\ a^{b \times c} &= (a^c)^b \end{aligned}$$

Take logarithms, and flip equations:

$$\begin{aligned} \log_a 1 &= 0 \\ \log_a a &= 1 \\ \log_a(u \times v) &= \log_a u + \log_a v \\ \log_a(u^b) &= b \times \log_a u \end{aligned}$$

Logarithms

$$\log_a 1 = 0$$

$$\log_a a = 1$$

$$\log_a(u \times v) = \log_a u + \log_a v$$

$$\log_a(u^b) = b \times \log_a u$$

Logarithms

$$\log_a 1 = 0$$

$$\log_a a = 1$$

$$\log_a(u \times v) = \log_a u + \log_a v$$

$$\log_a(u^b) = b \times \log_a u$$

Game: whose memo trie is it?

Logarithms

$$\begin{aligned}\log_a 1 &= 0 \\ \log_a a &= 1 \\ \log_a(u \times v) &= \log_a u + \log_a v \\ \log_a(u^b) &= b \times \log_a u\end{aligned}$$

Game: whose memo trie is it?

```
data P a = P a a
data S a = C a (S a)
data T a = B a (P (T a))
```

Logarithms

$$\log_a 1 = 0$$

$$\log_a a = 1$$

$$\log_a(u \times v) = \log_a u + \log_a v$$

$$\log_a(u^b) = b \times \log_a u$$

Game: whose memo trie is it?

data $P\ a = P\ a\ a$

data $S\ a = C\ a\ (S\ a)$

data $T\ a = B\ a\ (P\ (T\ a))$

$P\ a \cong a \times a$

$S\ a \cong a \times S\ a$

$T\ a \cong a \times P\ (T\ a)$

Logarithms

$$\begin{aligned}\log_a 1 &= 0 \\ \log_a a &= 1 \\ \log_a(u \times v) &= \log_a u + \log_a v \\ \log_a(u^b) &= b \times \log_a u\end{aligned}$$

Game: whose memo trie is it?

data $P\ a = P\ a\ a$
data $S\ a = C\ a\ (S\ a)$
data $T\ a = B\ a\ (P\ (T\ a))$

$P\ a \cong a \times a$
 $S\ a \cong a \times S\ a$
 $T\ a \cong a \times P\ (T\ a)$

data $LP = False \mid True$
data $LS = Zero \mid Succ\ LS$
data $LT = Empty \mid Dig\ LT\ LP$

$LP \cong \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}$
 $LS \cong \mathbf{1} + LS$
 $LT \cong \mathbf{1} + LT \times LP$

Memoization via higher-order types

Functor combinators:

```
data      Const b a = Const b
newtype Id      a = Id a
data      (f + g) a = Sum   (f a + g a)
data      (f × g) a = Prod  (f a × g a)
newtype (g ∘ f) a = Comp (g (f a))
```

Memoization via higher-order types

Functor combinators:

```
data      Const b a = Const b
newtype Id      a = Id a
data      (f + g) a = Sum   (f a + g a)
data      (f × g) a = Prod  (f a × g a)
newtype (g ∘ f) a = Comp (g (f a))
```

Exponentials:

```
Exp 0      = Const 1
Exp 1      = Id
Exp (a + b) = Exp a × Exp b
Exp (a × b) = Exp a ∘ Exp b
```

Memoization via higher-order types

Functor combinators:

```
data      Const b a = Const b
newtype Id      a = Id a
data      (f + g) a = Sum   (f a + g a)
data      (f × g) a = Prod  (f a × g a)
newtype (g ∘ f) a = Comp (g (f a))
```

Exponentials:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Exp } \mathbf{0} &= \text{Const } \mathbf{1} \\ \text{Exp } \mathbf{1} &= \text{Id} \\ \text{Exp } (a + b) &= \text{Exp } a \times \text{Exp } b \\ \text{Exp } (a \times b) &= \text{Exp } a \circ \text{Exp } b \end{aligned}$$

Logarithms:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Log } (\text{Const } b) &= \mathbf{0} \\ \text{Log } \text{Id} &= \mathbf{1} \\ \text{Log } (f \times g) &= \text{Log } f + \text{Log } g \\ \text{Log } (g \circ f) &= \text{Log } g \times \text{Log } f \end{aligned}$$

An *almost* beautiful story

- Memoization: *conversion of functions into data structures.*
- Purely functional, directed by type isomorphisms.
- Practical in a non-strict language!
- Simple denotation *and* incremental tabulation.

However, an ironic flaw:

An *almost* beautiful story

- Memoization: *conversion of functions into data structures.*
- Purely functional, directed by type isomorphisms.
- Practical in a non-strict language!
- Simple denotation *and* incremental tabulation.

However, an ironic flaw:

The type isomorphisms only hold for a *strict* language.

Some memoization challenges

- Non-strict
- Higher-order
- Polymorphic
- Deep

References

- Ralf Hinze's paper *Memo functions, polytypically!*.
- These slides
- *MemoTrie*: Hackage, GitHub
- data-memocombinators
- Memoization blog posts

Correctness Proofs

Void

instance *HasTrie* 0 where

type 0 \mapsto *a* = 1

trie void = ()

untrie () = void

Void

instance HasTrie 0 where

type 0 ↪ a = 1

trie void = ()

untrie () = void

Laws:

$$\begin{aligned} & \textit{untrie (trie void)} \\ & \equiv \textit{untrie ()} \\ & \equiv \textit{void} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \textit{trie (untrie ())} \\ & \equiv \textit{trie void} \\ & \equiv () \end{aligned}$$

Unit

instance HasTrie 1 where

type 1 $\mapsto a = a$

trie f = f ()

untrie a = $\lambda() \rightarrow a$

Unit

instance *HasTrie* 1 where

type 1 $\mapsto a = a$

trie f $= f ()$

untrie a $= \lambda() \rightarrow a$

Laws:

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{untrie} (\text{trie } f) \\ & \equiv \text{untrie} (f ()) \\ & \equiv \lambda() \rightarrow f () \\ & \equiv f \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{trie} (\text{untrie } a) \\ & \equiv \text{trie} (\lambda() \rightarrow a) \\ & \equiv (\lambda() \rightarrow a) () \\ & \equiv a \end{aligned}$$

Boolean

```
instance HasTrie Bool where
  type Bool ↪ a = a × a
  trie f = (f False, f True)
  untrie (x, y) = λc → if c then y else x
```

Boolean

instance HasTrie Bool where

type $\text{Bool} \mapsto a = a \times a$

$\text{trie } f = (f \text{ False}, f \text{ True})$

$\text{untrie } (x, y) = \lambda c \rightarrow \text{if } c \text{ then } y \text{ else } x$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{untrie } (\text{trie } f) \\ & \equiv \text{untrie } (f \text{ False}, f \text{ True}) \\ & \equiv \text{if}' (f \text{ False}) (f \text{ True}) \\ & \equiv f \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{trie } (\text{untrie } (x, y)) \\ & \equiv \text{trie } (\text{if}' x y) \\ & \equiv (\text{if}' x y \text{ False}, \text{if}' y x \text{ True}) \\ & \equiv (x, y) \end{aligned}$$

Note:

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{if}' (f \text{ False}) (f \text{ True}) \\ & \equiv \lambda c \rightarrow \text{if } c \text{ then } f \text{ True } \text{ else } f \text{ False} \\ & \equiv \lambda c \rightarrow \text{if } c \text{ then } f \text{ c } \text{ else } f \text{ c} \\ & \equiv f \end{aligned}$$

Sums

```
instance (HasTrie b, HasTrie c) ⇒ HasTrie (b + c) where
  type (b + c) ↪ a = (b ↪ a) × (c ↪ a)
  trie f = (trie (f ∘ Left), trie (f ∘ Right))
  untrie (s, t) = untrie s ||| untrie t
```

where

$$\begin{aligned}(g ||| h)(Left\ b) &= g\ b \\(g ||| h)(Right\ c) &= h\ c\end{aligned}$$

Sums

instance (*HasTrie b*, *HasTrie c*) \Rightarrow *HasTrie* (*b + c*) **where**
type (*b + c*) \mapsto *a* = (*b* \mapsto *a*) \times (*c* \mapsto *a*)
trie f = (*trie* (*f* \circ *Left*)), *trie* (*f* \circ *Right*))
untrie (*s, t*) = *untrie s* $\parallel\!\parallel$ *untrie t*

where

$$(g \parallel\!\parallel h) (\text{Left } b) = g \ b$$
$$(g \parallel\!\parallel h) (\text{Right } c) = h \ c$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{untrie} (\text{trie } f) \\ & \equiv \text{untrie} (\text{trie} (f \circ \text{Left}), \text{trie} (f \circ \text{Right})) \\ & \equiv \text{untrie} (\text{trie} (f \circ \text{Left})) \parallel\!\parallel \text{untrie} (\text{trie} (f \circ \text{Right})) \\ & \equiv f \circ \text{Left} \parallel\!\parallel f \circ \text{Right} \\ & \equiv f \end{aligned}$$

Sums

instance (*HasTrie b*, *HasTrie c*) \Rightarrow *HasTrie* (*b + c*) **where**
type (*b + c*) \mapsto *a* = (*b* \mapsto *a*) \times (*c* \mapsto *a*)
trie f = (*trie* (*f* \circ *Left*)), *trie* (*f* \circ *Right*))
untrie (*s, t*) = *untrie s* $\parallel\!\parallel$ *untrie t*

where

$$(g \parallel\!\parallel h) (\text{Left } b) = g \ b$$
$$(g \parallel\!\parallel h) (\text{Right } c) = h \ c$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{trie} (\text{untrie} (s, t)) \\ \equiv & \text{trie} (\text{untrie } s \parallel\!\parallel \text{untrie } t) \\ \equiv & (\text{trie} ((\text{untrie } s \parallel\!\parallel \text{untrie } t) \circ \text{Left}) \\ & , \text{trie} ((\text{untrie } s \parallel\!\parallel \text{untrie } t) \circ \text{Right})) \\ \equiv & (\text{trie} (\text{untrie } s), \text{trie} (\text{untrie } t)) \\ \equiv & (s, t) \end{aligned}$$

Products

instance (*HasTrie b*, *HasTrie c*) \Rightarrow *HasTrie* (*b* \times *c*) **where**
type (*b* \times *c*) \mapsto *a* = *b* \mapsto (*c* \mapsto *a*)
trie f = *trie* (*trie* \circ *curry f*)
untrie t = *uncurry* (*untrie* \circ *untrie t*)

where

$$\begin{aligned} \text{curry } g\ b\ c &= g(b, c) \\ \text{uncurry } h(b, c) &= h\ b\ c \end{aligned}$$

Products

instance (*HasTrie b*, *HasTrie c*) \Rightarrow *HasTrie* (*b* \times *c*) **where**
type (*b* \times *c*) \mapsto *a* = *b* \mapsto (*c* \mapsto *a*)
trie f = *trie* (*trie* \circ *curry f*)
untrie t = *uncurry* (*untrie* \circ *untrie t*)

where

$$\begin{aligned} \text{curry } g\ b\ c &= g(b, c) \\ \text{uncurry } h(b, c) &= h\ b\ c \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{untrie } (\text{trie } f) &\equiv \text{untrie } (\text{trie } (\text{trie } \circ \text{curry } f)) \\ &\equiv \text{uncurry } (\text{untrie } \circ \text{untrie } (\text{trie } (\text{trie } \circ \text{curry } f))) \\ &\equiv \text{uncurry } (\text{untrie } \circ \text{trie } \circ \text{curry } f) \\ &\equiv \text{uncurry } (\text{curry } f) \\ &\equiv f \end{aligned}$$

Products

instance (*HasTrie b*, *HasTrie c*) \Rightarrow *HasTrie* (*b* \times *c*) **where**
type (*b* \times *c*) \mapsto *a* = *b* \mapsto (*c* \mapsto *a*)
trie f = *trie* (*trie* \circ *curry f*)
untrie t = *uncurry* (*untrie* \circ *untrie t*)

where

$$\begin{aligned} \text{curry } g\ b\ c &= g(b, c) \\ \text{uncurry } h(b, c) &= h\ b\ c \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} &\text{trie}(\text{untrie } t) \\ &\equiv \text{trie}(\text{uncurry}(\text{untrie} \circ \text{untrie } t)) \\ &\equiv \text{trie}(\text{trie} \circ \text{curry}(\text{uncurry}(\text{untrie} \circ \text{untrie } t))) \\ &\equiv \text{trie}(\text{trie} \circ \text{untrie} \circ \text{untrie } t) \\ &\equiv \text{trie}(\text{untrie } t) \\ &\equiv t \end{aligned}$$